

# **Google's Response**

**Redacted Version of  
Document Sought to be  
Sealed**

1 **QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART & SULLIVAN, LLP**

2 Diane M. Doolittle (CA Bar No. 142046)  
dianedoolittle@quinnemanuel.com  
3 Sara Jenkins (CA Bar No. 230097)  
sarajenkins@quinnemanuel.com  
4 555 Twin Dolphin Drive, 5th Floor  
Redwood Shores, CA 94065  
5 Telephone: (650) 801-5000  
Facsimile: (650) 801-5100

Andrew H. Schapiro (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
andrewschapiro@quinnemanuel.com  
Teuta Fani (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
teutafani@quinnemanuel.com  
191 N. Wacker Drive, Suite 2700  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Telephone: (312) 705-7400  
Facsimile: (312) 705-7401

7 Stephen A. Broome (CA Bar No. 314605)  
stephenbroome@quinnemanuel.com  
8 Viola Trebicka (CA Bar No. 269526)  
violatrebicka@quinnemanuel.com  
9 Crystal Nix-Hines (Bar No. 326971)  
crystalnixhines@quinnemanuel.com  
10 Alyssa G. Olson (CA Bar No. 305705)  
alyolson@quinnemanuel.com  
11 865 S. Figueroa Street, 10th Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90017  
12 Telephone: (213) 443-3000  
Facsimile: (213) 443-3100

Josef Ansorge (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
josefansorge@quinnemanuel.com  
Xi (“Tracy”) Gao (CA Bar No. 326266)  
tracygao@quinnemanuel.com  
Carl Spilly (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
carlspilly@quinnemanuel.com  
1300 I Street NW, Suite 900  
Washington D.C., 20005  
Telephone: (202) 538-8000  
Facsimile: (202) 538-8100

14 Jomaire Crawford (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
jomairecrawford@quinnemanuel.com  
15 51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor  
16 New York, NY 10010  
17 Telephone: (212) 849-7000  
Facsimile: (212) 849-7100

Jonathan Tse (CA Bar No. 305468)  
jonathantse@quinnemanuel.com  
50 California Street, 22nd Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Telephone: (415) 875-6600  
Facsimile: (415) 875-6700

18 *Counsel for Defendant Google LLC*

19 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

20 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, OAKLAND DIVISION

21 CHASOM BROWN, WILLIAM BYATT,  
22 JEREMY DAVIS, CHRISTOPHER  
23 CASTILLO, and MONIQUE TRUJILLO,  
24 individually and on behalf of all similarly  
situated,

Case No. 4:20-cv-03664-YGR-SVK

25 Plaintiffs,  
**GOOGLE LLC’S SUBMISSION IN  
RESPONSE TO DKT. 604**

26 v.  
27 **Judge: Hon. Susan van Keulen**

28 GOOGLE LLC,  
Defendant.

1 Pursuant to the Court’s June 9, 2022 Order on Google’s Administrative Motion for  
 2 Clarification of May 20, 2022 Preservation Order (“Clarification Order”) (Dkt. 604), in this  
 3 submission Google “identifies and describes the keys that Google is seeking to carve out of the  
 4 Preservation Order on the ground that the keys are not required,” Dkt. 604 at 3, and seeks a minor  
 5 clarification related to retention periods of sources retained permanently.

6 **1. Clarification On Encryption Keys Google Seeks to Exempt**

7 The Court ordered only “relevant, *necessary* rotating encryption keys be preserved.” Dkt.  
 8 604 at 3 (emphasis in original). Two sets of encryption keys fall outside the scope of the preservation  
 9 order because they are not relevant or necessary:

10 ***Encryption Keys Not Associated with Relevant Data.*** Those encryption keys that are not  
 11 associated with the data the Court has held needs to be preserved necessarily fall outside of the  
 12 Court’s order because they are not relevant. Google is confident that the Court could not have meant  
 13 for such keys to be included in the preservation, but out of an abundance of caution Google would  
 14 like to obtain written clarification by the Court on this exemption.

15 [REDACTED]. [REDACTED]  
 16 [REDACTED], *Calhoun* Dkt. 713-8 ¶ 5 (Chan Decl), should also be exempted from the  
 17 Court’s order because, as Google explains below, this encryption key is extremely sensitive and  
 18 Google proposes a satisfactory work-around in lieu of preservation of the key.

19 *First*, there are undue privacy and security risks associated with preserving the [REDACTED]  
 20 [REDACTED]  
 21 [REDACTED]  
 22 [REDACTED]  
 23 [REDACTED]  
 24 [REDACTED]  
 25 [REDACTED]  
 26 [REDACTED]  
 27 [REDACTED]  
 28 [REDACTED]

1 [REDACTED]  
 2 [REDACTED]  
 3 [REDACTED]

4 Second, given these outsized risks, Google is committed to engineering and implementing  
 5 work-arounds to full preservation of the [REDACTED] thus rendering the preservation  
 6 of this key unnecessary for purposes of decrypting the data to be preserved pursuant to the  
 7 Preservation Plan. Dkt. 604 at 3; *see also* Dkt. 587 at 8 (“Google should be required to preserve all  
 8 encryption keys **necessary** to decrypt identifiers and cookies.”) (emphasis added). Google is willing  
 9 to perform the following three steps, which together are more than sufficient to ensure that the  
 10 relevant data is capable of decryption: [REDACTED]

11 [REDACTED]  
 12 [REDACTED]  
 13 [REDACTED] *See Calhoun Dkt. 713-8 ¶ 10*  
 14 (Chan Decl). Google proposes an additional encryption step to store preserved user data securely.

15 **2. Clarification Related to Sources Retained Permanently**

16 The June 9, 2022 Order clarified the Court’s intent in requiring Google to seek leave of the  
 17 Court to shorten any retention period “for any data source that is currently retained ‘forever.’” Dkt.  
 18 604 at 2. Specifically, “the Court anticipated that data sources that do not have retention periods ...  
 19 may have been excluded from the lists of data sources to be preserved because of the absence of a  
 20 retention period.” *Id.* Google respectfully notes that the Preservation Plan already included five data  
 21 sources currently retained “forever”: [REDACTED] (Dkt. 587-1 at 2, R&R Index #6);  
 22 [REDACTED] (*id.*, R&R Index 52); [REDACTED] (*id.*, R&R Index #56); [REDACTED] (*id.*,  
 23 R&R Index # 60), and [REDACTED] (Dkt. 587 at 7:23). In addition, [REDACTED] that are  
 24 currently retained “forever” have been identified as relevant data sources as part of the Special  
 25 Master process: [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]

26 [REDACTED]

27 Google seeks to confirm that the Court’s requirement regarding “any data source ...  
 28 preserved in perpetuity” in the Clarification Order is in reference to the aforementioned [REDACTED]

1 curated by the Preservation Order and the eight-month review before the Special Master, *not* any  
2 data sources within Google. The latter standard would be inefficient and burdensome for both  
3 Google to comply with and for the Court to administer.

4  
5 DATED: June 21, 2022

QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &  
SULLIVAN, LLP

6  
7 By /s/ Andrew H. Schapiro

Andrew H. Schapiro (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
andrewschapiro@quinnemanuel.com  
Teuta Fani (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
teutafani@quinnemanuel.com  
191 N. Wacker Drive, Suite 2700  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Telephone: (312) 705-7400  
Facsimile: (312) 705-7401

Stephen A. Broome (CA Bar No. 314605)  
stephenbroome@quinnemanuel.com  
Viola Trebicka (CA Bar No. 269526)  
violatrebicka@quinnemanuel.com  
Crystal Nix-Hines (Bar No. 326971)  
crystalnixhines@quinnemanuel.com  
Alyssa G. Olson (CA Bar No. 305705)  
alyolson@quinnemanuel.com  
865 S. Figueroa Street, 10th Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90017  
Telephone: (213) 443-3000  
Facsimile: (213) 443-3100

Diane M. Doolittle (CA Bar No. 142046)  
dianedoolittle@quinnemanuel.com  
Sara Jenkins (CA Bar No. 230097)  
sarajenkins@quinnemanuel.com  
555 Twin Dolphin Drive, 5th Floor  
Redwood Shores, CA 94065  
Telephone: (650) 801-5000  
Facsimile: (650) 801-5100

Josef Ansorge (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
josefansorge@quinnemanuel.com  
Xi (“Tracy”) Gao (CA Bar No. 326266)  
tracygao@quinnemanuel.com  
Carl Spilly (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
carlspilly@quinnemanuel.com  
1300 I. Street, N.W., Suite 900

1 Washington, D.C. 20005  
2 Telephone: 202-538-8000  
3 Facsimile: 202-538-8100

4 Jomaire A. Crawford (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
5 jomairecrawford@quinnmanuel.com  
6 51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor  
7 New York, NY 10010  
8 Telephone: (212) 849-7000  
9 Facsimile: (212) 849-7100

10 Jonathan Tse (CA Bar No. 305468)  
11 jonathantse@quinnmanuel.com  
12 50 California Street, 22nd Floor  
13 San Francisco, CA 94111  
14 Telephone: (415) 875-6600  
15 Facsimile: (415) 875-6700

16 *Attorneys for Defendant Google LLC*

17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28